The application of corporate governance to the earnings management of the banking industry in Indonesia in the 2007-2009 period

Bimantoro Adi Pratomo

Accounting Study Program, Indonesian College of Economics Banking School Jakarta, Indonesia

Article Info	ABSTRACT
	The aims of this research is to examine the influence of corporate governance mechanisms, such as, board of commissioner composition and size, audit committee size, composition of independent audit committee members and their expertise on earnings management practice in public bank companies listed in Indonesia Stock Exchange. The samples of this research are all of the public bank companies that existed in Indonesia in the year 2007-2009 which were listed on the Indonesia Stock Exchange. The research data were collected from the public bank's financial statement and annual report for the period of 2007 to 2009. From purposive sampling method, I have collected 72 observations from 24 public bank companies/3 years. By using multiple regression analysis as the research method, the results showed that five independent variables influenced the earnings management of public bank companies simultaneously. The conclusion of this research is only board commissioner composition and audit committee expertise that significantly affects earnings management, while board commissioner size, composition of independent audit committee members and size has no significant effect on earnings management. *This is an open access article underthe CC BY-NC license.*

Corresponding Author:

Bimantoro Adi Pratomo,
Accounting Study Program,
Indonesian Banking School of Economics, Jakarta,
Jl. Kemang Raya No. 35, RT. 6/RW. 1, Bangka, Kec. Mampang Prpt., City of South Jakarta, Special Capital Region of Jakarta 12730,
Email: AdiPratomo03@gmail.com

1. INTRODUCTION

For investors who carry out investment activities in Indonesia, the financial statements of the Indonesian economy are currently experiencing an increase. This is indicated by the large number of investment activities that enter Indonesia, both in the form of foreign direct investment and through a foreign portfolio investment in the stock market which is one of the main references for assessing the financial performance of companies that will be targeted for investment.

The financial statements presented in the form of a balance sheet, profit and loss statement, and cash flow statement reflect the track record of a company's financial development during a certain period. From 1998 to 2001, there have been many financial scandals in public companies involving manipulation of financial reports, such as what happened to PT Lippo, Tbk and PT Kimia Farma, Tbk (Boediono, 2005). As a public company that registers its shares on the stock market, the presentation and disclosure of financial statements should comply with applicable financial accounting standards both in the form of PSAK and the provisions imposed by Bapepam as the supervisor of the capital market in Indonesia.

One element of information that is an important reference for users of financial statements in assessing the company's development is the company's profit. The company's profit describes an acquisition of net income that was successfully collected by the company during one period after deducting the expenses incurred by the company to collect income. Earnings management actions carried out by this management can be detrimental to users of financial statements, especially shareholders who have direct ownership authority over the company. Conceptually, the shareholders or owners of the company are the principal parties, while the management acts as an agent for the company.

One of the causes of the condition for the emergence of financial statement manipulation that occurs in these companies is the lack of implementation of corporate governance (Setiawan and Nasution, 2007). Evidence shows that weak corporate governance practices in Indonesia lead to deficiencies in company decision-making and company actions. According to the Forum for Corporate Governance in Indonesia (FCGI), corporate governance is a proposed concept because corporate governance systems help improve company performance through supervision or monitoring of management performance. and guarantee management accountability to stakeholders based on the regulatory framework so that more transparent corporate management will be achieved for all users of financial reports.

The banking industry is an industry that has different characteristics from other industries that are developing in Indonesia. The banking industry is engaged in the financial sector as an intermediary institution whose job is to collect funds from people who have excess funds in the form of savings, demand deposits and time deposits to then distribute them to the public in the form of credit. This industry is an industry that operates on the basis of public trust. If public trust in banks decreases or disappears due to negative issues, this will result in a rush that can disrupt bank liquidity, as happened in the 1998 monetary crisis. If liquidity or trust in one bank is disrupted, other banks will be affected.

Bank Indonesia as the highest monetary policy holder in Indonesia and also as Indonesia's banking supervisor has tightened regulations on banks in Indonesia. This is done to maintain the health of the bank. One of the regulations issued by Bank Indonesia, for example, is the fulfillment of the minimum CAR for each bank. their company can meet the criteria required by BI. Considering the high risk that is owned by the banking industry, corporate governance is needed to minimize the level of earnings management in the banking industry while at the same time helping to create a conducive environment for creating efficient and sustainable growth in the banking environment.

Bank Indonesia defines good corporate governance as a bank governance that applies the principles of transparency, accountability, responsibility, independence and fairness. In the PBI, Bank Indonesia emphasizes the implementation of good corporate governance at several management levels in the banking organizational structure such as the board of commissioners, directors, and several committees. The Audit Committee monitors and evaluates the planning and implementation of audits as well as monitors follow-up on audit results in order to assess the adequacy of internal controls including the adequacy of the financial reporting process. The Risk Monitoring Committee has the task of evaluating risk management policies for their implementation and monitoring the implementation of the duties of the Risk Management Committee and the Risk Management Work Unit. Meanwhile, the Remuneration and Nomination Committee is primarily responsible for the remuneration and nomination process for the board of commissioners and directors.

2.   RESEARCH METHOD

The object of this study are national commercial banks listed on the Indonesia Stock Exchange during the 2007-2009 period with a focus on corporate governance and earnings management. The selection of corporate governance as the research focus is based on the premise that corporate governance is a corporate management concept that prioritizes transparency so that it can influence

earnings management actions. The concept of corporate governance has now become an obligation for banks operating in Indonesia based on PBI No 8/4/PBI/2006.

Methods of data collection. This research was conducted with reference to secondary data collected by researchers from certain sources related to corporate governance and earnings management. Secondary data is data obtained from pre-existing sources and does not need to be collected by the researcher himself. Secondary data used in this research are literature, research journals, articles, reports, and other documents. The reports used in this study are audited annual financial reports and reports on the implementation of good corporate governance contained in the annual reports of national commercial banks for 2007-2009 which are listed on the Indonesia Stock Exchange.

Sampling method. The sampling technique was carried out by purposive sampling method with the aim of obtaining a representative sample according to the specified criteria. the population is the whole group of people, events, or other things that the researcher wants to investigate, while the sample is part of the population, whose members are selected from that population. The population in this study were all banking companies listed on the Indonesia Stock Exchange during the 2007-2009 period.

Data Collection Techniques To obtain corporate governance and earnings management data needed in this study, the authors used the following data collection techniques: a). Library Studies (Library Research), this technique is carried out by studying various literature in the form of text books, journals, and articles that discuss corporate governance and earnings management. b). Data collection, this technique is done by looking at and studying documents and recording written data that has something to do with the object of research. Data were collected in the form of financial reports, annual reports and reports on the implementation of banking GCG listed on the Indonesia Stock Exchange 2007-2009 through the Indonesian Stock Exchange internet site and the websites of each company.

Data analysis method. a). Data Processing Techniques. Data processing begins with taking and changing raw data related to corporate governance mechanisms including the composition of the independent board of commissioners, the size of the board of commissioners, the size of the audit committee, the composition of independent parties in the audit committee, and the expertise of the audit committee and obtaining proxies from management profit.

Hypothesis Testing Techniques. To find out the level of significance of the independent variables and the dependent variable in this study, a hypothesis test was carried out with the following steps: 1). Classical Assumption Test, One method of estimating parameters in a linear regression model is Ordinary Least Square (OLS). The OLS method is used based on a number of certain assumptions. a). Residual Normality Test, the assumption of normality of disturbance or error (ut) is very important, because the model existence test (F test) as well as the validity test for the influence of independent variables (t test) and the estimation of the value of the dependent variable require this. b). Multicollinearity test. The multicollinearity test aims to determine whether there is a correlation between the independent variables in the regression model. c). Heteroscedasticity Test, The heteroscedasticity test aims to find out whether in the regression model there are similarities or differences in variance from one observation to another. d). Autocorrelation test (Autocorrelation), Autocorrelation test aims to see whether in a regression model there is a correlation between confounding errors in period t (analysis period) with errors in period t-1 (previous period). 2). Descriptive Statistics Descriptive statistics aim to provide an overview or description of a data seen from the average, standard deviation, minimum, and maximum. 3). The autocorrelation test aims to see whether in a regression model there is a correlation between confounding errors in period t (analysis period) and errors in period t-1 (previous period). 2). Descriptive Statistics Descriptive statistics aim to provide an overview or description of a data seen from the average, standard deviation, minimum, and maximum. 3). The autocorrelation test aims to see whether in a regression model there is a correlation between confounding errors in period t (analysis period) and errors in period t-1 (previous period). 2). Descriptive Statistics Descriptive statistics aim to provide an

overview or description of a data seen from the average, standard deviation, minimum, and maximum. 3). Partial Testing (t test, Partial testing with t test is intended to test whether or not the influence of each independent variable is strong on the dependent variable. The test is carried out at a 95% confidence level or a significance level (α) of 5% with the following criteria:

Ho is accepted and Ha is rejected if prob. t > 0.05

Ho is rejected and Ha is accepted if prob. t ≤ 0.05

The formulation of the hypothesis proposed is:

Ho1 : $\beta_1 = 0$

The composition of the board of commissioners partially has no effect on earnings management.

Ha1 : $\beta_1 \neq 0$

Composition   board commissioner   in a manner   Partial   influential on earnings management.

Ho2 : $\beta_2 = 0$

The size of the board of commissioners partially has no effect on earnings management.

Ho3 : $\beta_3 = 0$

The size of the audit committee partially has no effect on earnings management.

Ha3 : $\beta_3 \neq 0$

The size of the audit committee partially affects earnings management.

Ho4 : $\beta_4 = 0$

The composition of the independent audit committee partially has no effect on earnings management.

Ha4 : $\beta_4 \neq 0$

The composition of the independent audit committee partially influences earnings management.

Ho5 : $\beta_5 = 0$

Audit committee expertise partially does not affect earnings management.

Ha5 : $\beta_5 \neq 0$

Audit committee expertise partially affects earnings management.

4). Simultaneous Significance Test (F Test), Simultaneous significance test (F test) is intended to test whether or not the influence of the independent variables as a whole (simultaneous) on the dependent variable.

The formulation of the hypothesis proposed in the simultaneous significance test is:

Ho : $\beta_1 = \beta_2 = \beta_3 = \beta_4 = \beta_5 = 0$...(1)

The corporate governance mechanism in this case the composition of the independent commissioners, the size of the board of commissioners, the size of the audit committee, the composition of the independent audit committee and the expertise of the audit committee have no simultaneous effect on earnings management.

Ha : $\beta_1 \neq \beta_2 \neq \beta_3 \neq \beta_4 \neq \beta_5 \neq 0$ ....(2)

The corporate governance mechanism, in this case the composition of the independent commissioners, the size of the board of commissioners, the size of the audit committee, the composition of the independent audit committee, and the expertise of the audit committee have a simultaneous effect on earnings management.

3.   RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

Banking is an intermediary institution that collects funds from the public in the form of deposits and distributes them back in the form of credit on the basis of trust. Therefore, banking is an industry

that has very strict regulations. In carrying out its operational activities, banks do not only refer to laws made by the government, but also to regulations made by Bank Indonesia as the supervisor of commercial banks in Indonesia. Based on data from Bank Indonesia, currently there are 149 commercial banks operating in Indonesia with the following details:

Table.1 Data on the Number of Commercial Banks in Indonesia

Information	Amount
state-owned banks	5
Foreign Exchange BUSN	44
Non Foreign Exchange BUSN	35
BPD	26
Mixed Bank	28
Foreign Banks	11
Amount	**149**

Source: Bank Indonesia (*www.bi.go.id*), processed.

This amount is only for conventional commercial banks and does not include sharia business units, sharia commercial banks and conventional rural banks. Of the 149 conventional commercial banks registered with Bank Indonesia, not all of them are listed on the Indonesia Stock Exchange. The number of conventional commercial banks that have been listed on the Indonesia Stock Exchange until 2009 was 29 banks.

Determination of the pooled data regression estimation model between the common effect (OLS) model, fixed effect, or random effect is carried out by carrying out the Chow test and Hausmann test.

Table.2 Regression Results of the Common Effect Method

Variables	coefficient	std. Error	t-Statistics	Prob.
C	76.72018	10.51838	7.293913	0.0000
KDK?	-3.738195	0.674000	-5.546287	0.0000
UDK?	2.531616	1.268025	1.996503	0.0500
AC_NUMB?	0.171120	0.085856	1.993106	0.0504
AC_INDP?	0.031231	0.049374	0.632538	0.5292
AC_EXPERT?	-27.73878	6.448220	-4.301774	0.0001
R-squared	0.486086	Mean dependent var		58.88889
Adjusted R-squared	0.447153	SD dependent var		11.91112
SE of regression	8.856358	Akaike info criterion		7.279804
Sum squared residue	5176715	Schwarz criterion		7.469526
Likelihood logs	-256.0729	Hannan-Quinn criter.		7.355333
F-statistics	12.48522	Durbin-Watson stat		1.337727
Prob(F-statistic)	0.000000			

Source: Processed Results

Based on the two regression results tables above, the sum square residual value for the calculation of the Common Effect method is 5176.715. Meanwhile, the sum square residual value for calculating the Fixed Effect method is 1398.348. The number of observations for the two methods above is 24 companies with a period of 3 years and the number of independent variables is 5 variables.

1. **Classic assumption test**

   The classical assumption test in this study was conducted to obtain a linear regression model that meets the BLUE assumptions (Best Linear Unbiased Estimator). The classical assumption test consists of a normality test, multicollinearity test, autocorrelation test, and heteroscedasticity test.

a.   Residual Normality TestThe normality test aims to determine whether there is interference or error (ut) between the difference in the observed dependent variable data and the dependent variable predicted by the regression equation.
Ho : ut values are normally distributed

Ha: the ut value is not normally distributed. The criteria for the tests carried out are:

Ho is accepted if the statistical significance of Jarque Bera is > 0.05

Ha is accepted if the statistical significance of Jarque Bera ≤ 0.05

b.   Multicollinearity Test
The multicollinearity test aims to determine whether there is a correlation between the independent variables in the regression model. The basis for decision making in the multicollinearity test is the value of the Variance Inflation Factor (VIF) which is around 1 and less than 10 and the correlation between independent variables is weak (below 0.9).

Table 3. Multicollinearity Test Results

Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.	Collinearity Statistics	
	B	std. Error	Betas			tolerance	VIF
(Constant)	-.208	.119		-1,741	087		
KDK	-.001	001	-.140	-.968	.337	.643	1,556
UDK	002	006	044	.268	.789	.499	2003
AC_NUMB	.023	010	.363	2,370	.021	.572	1,749
AC_INDP	001	001	.242	1863	.067	.792	1,263
AC_EXPERT	001	.000	.148	1,237	.221	.938	1,066

c.   Heteroscedasticity Test
The heteroscedasticity test aims to find out whether in the regression model there are similarities or differences in variance from one observation to another. In this study, the heteroscedasticity test was carried out using the Glesjer test.
Ho is accepted and Ha is rejected if prob. $\chi2$ > 0.05
Ho is rejected and Ha is accepted if prob. $\chi2$ ≤ 0.05
The formulation of the hypothesis proposed in the model is:
Ho: There is no heteroscedasticity problem in the model
Ha : There is a problem of heteroscedasticity in the model

2.   **Descriptive statistics**.
Descriptive statistics aim to provide an overview or description of a data seen from the average, standard deviation, minimum, and maximum.

Table 4. Results of Descriptive Statistics

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Means	std. Deviation
KDK	67	43	100	59.04	12.125
UDK	67	1	8	5.09	1856
AC_NUMB	67	2	7	3.76	1.143
AC_INDP	67	50	100	92.31	13,951
AC_EXPERT	67	33	100	81.15	19,903
DA	67	-.20175	.11888	-.0025848	.07227434
Valid N (listwise)	67				

Source: Processed Results

Based on table 4. the average value of the variable composition of the board of commissioners (KDK) is 59.04%. This value is higher than the value of the composition of the independent board of commissioners stipulated by Bank Indonesia through PBI No. 8/4/PBI/2006

concerning GCG. Thus it can be concluded that on average Indonesian banks have complied with the GCG regulations stipulated by Bank Indonesia as the banking authority.

3. **Hypothesis Testing Results**

As previously described in the Research Methodology, hypothesis testing in this study uses multiple regression methods. The total sample for three years is 72 samples. However, the number of samples was reduced to 67 after handling to meet the assumptions of the residual normality test.

The multiple regression model in this study uses a Fixed Effect model based on the results of the Chow test and Hausmann test with the following equation:

$$DA_{it} = \alpha + \beta_1 KDK + \beta_2 UDK + \beta_3 AC\_NUMB + \beta_4 AC\_INDP + \beta_5 AC\_EXPERT + \varepsilon_{it}$$

Regression results through the F test between the dependent variable (DA) and all independent variables (KDK, UDK, AC_NUMB, AC_INDP, and AC_EXPERT) obtained an F value of 7.118849 with a significance level of 0.000000 where this value is smaller than the α value 0.05. Therefore, Ho6 in this study was rejected or in other words Ha6 was accepted. Thus it can be concluded that the corporate governance variables, namely KDK, UDK, AC_NUMB, AC_INDP, and AC_EXPERT, have a simultaneous effect on DA. In addition, the adj-R Squared value of 0.714544 indicates that earnings management proxied by discretionary accruals (DA) can be explained by the corporate governance variables contained in the research model (KDK, UDK, AC_NUMB, AC_INDP, and AC_EXPERT) of 71, 45% while the rest is 28,

4. CONCLUSION

Based on the description that has been stated in the previous chapters, the conclusions obtained from this study are as follows: a). The results of data processing and regression equations show that earnings management practices in the banking industry can be explained by corporate governance mechanisms in this case the composition of the independent board of commissioners (KDK), the size of the board of commissioners (UDK), the size of the audit committee (AC_NUMB), the composition of the independent audit committee (AC_INDP), and audit committee expertise (AC_EXPERT). b). The implementation of corporate governance in this case the composition of the independent board of commissioners (KDK), the size of the board of commissioners (UDK), the size of the audit committee (AC_NUMB), the composition of the independent audit committee (AC_INDP), and the expertise of the audit committee (AC_EXPERT) have a significant effect simultaneously on management practice profits in the banking industry. c). The composition of the board of independent commissioners (KDK) has a significant negative effect on earnings management practices in banking. This shows that statistically the variable composition of the independent board of commissioners is able to reduce earnings management practices in the banking industry. The more members of the independent commissioners, the higher the quality of the supervisory process carried out by this board with the increasing number of independent parties within the company demanding transparency in the company's financial reporting. d). The size of the board of commissioners (UDK), the size of the audit committee (AC_NUMB), and the composition of the independent audit committee (AC_INDP) have no influence on earnings management practices in the banking industry. It is suspected that the size of the board of commissioners and the size of the audit committee owned by commercial banks are only to comply with the provisions set by Bank Indonesia. In addition, the duties and responsibilities of the audit committee are still focused on compliance with Bank Indonesia regulations. So that no matter how big the composition of the independent audit committee is, it will not affect earnings management practices. e). The audit committee's expertise in accounting and finance (AC_EXPERT) has a significant negative effect on earnings management practices. This shows that statistically the expertise of the audit committee is able to reduce earnings management practices in the banking industry. The expertise of commercial bank audit committees in accounting and finance is necessary because in practice the duties and responsibilities of supervision and evaluation carried out by audit committees are more focused on

financial reports. So that no matter how big the composition of the independent audit committee is, it will not affect earnings management practices. e). The audit committee's expertise in accounting and finance (AC_EXPERT) has a significant negative effect on earnings management practices. This shows that statistically the expertise of the audit committee is able to reduce earnings management practices in the banking industry. The expertise of commercial bank audit committees in accounting and finance is necessary because in practice the duties and responsibilities of supervision and evaluation carried out by audit committees are more focused on financial reports. So that no matter how big the composition of the independent audit committee is, it will not affect earnings management practices. e). The audit committee's expertise in accounting and finance (AC_EXPERT) has a significant negative effect on earnings management practices. This shows that statistically the expertise of the audit committee is able to reduce earnings management practices in the banking industry. The expertise of commercial bank audit committees in accounting and finance is necessary because in practice the duties and responsibilities of supervision and evaluation carried out by audit committees are more focused on financial reports. The audit committee's expertise in accounting and finance (AC_EXPERT) has a significant negative effect on earnings management practices. This shows that statistically the expertise of the audit committee is able to reduce earnings management practices in the banking industry. The expertise of commercial bank audit committees in accounting and finance is necessary because in practice the duties and responsibilities of supervision and evaluation carried out by audit committees are more focused on financial reports. The audit committee's expertise in accounting and finance (AC_EXPERT) has a significant negative effect on earnings management practices. This shows that statistically the expertise of the audit committee is able to reduce earnings management practices in the banking industry. The expertise of commercial bank audit committees in accounting and finance is necessary because in practice the duties and responsibilities of supervision and evaluation carried out by audit committees are more focused on financial reports.

REFERENCES

Ahmed, Anwer S., Carolyn Takeda, and Shawn Thomas. 1998. Bank Loan Loss Provisions: A Reexamination of Capital Management, Earnings Management, and Signaling Effects. Working Papers

Alijoyo, Antonius and Subarto Zaini. 2004. Independent Commissioner: Activator of GCG Practices in the Company. Jakarta: Index

Ariyoto, Kresnohadi. 2000. Good Corporate Governance and its Enforcement Concept in BUMN and its Business Environment. Entrepreneur Magazine No. 10 Years XXIX October 2000

Capital Market Supervisory Agency. 2004. Kep-29/PM/2004. Formation and Work Guidelines of the Audit Committee

Bank Indonesia. 2006. PBI No. 8/4/PBI/2006. Bank Indonesia Regulations Concerning the Implementation of Good Corporate Governance in Commercial Banks

Bapepam. 2006. Study of the Application of the 2004 OECD Principles in Bapepam Regulations Regarding Corporate Governance

Boediono, Gideon SB 2005. Profit Quality: Study of the Influence of Corporate Governance Mechanisms and the Impact of Profit Management Using Path Analysis. Article Presented at the 8th Solo National Symposium on Accounting September 15-16 2005

Indonesia stock exchange. 2001. Kep-339/BEJ/07-2001. General Provisions for the Listing of Equity-Type Securities at the Exchange

Indonesia stock exchange. 2001. SE-008/BEJ/12-2001. Membership of the Audit Committee

Chtourou, Sonda Marrakchi, Jean Bedard, and Lucie Courteau. 2001. Corporate

   Governance and Earnings Management. Available online at*www.ssrn.com*

Cornett, Marcia Millon, Jamie John McNutt, and Hassan Tehranian. 2006. Corporate Governance and Earnings Management At Large US Bank Holding Companies. Working Papers

FCGI. Booklet of Corporate Governance Series Volume II The Role of the Board of Commissioners and the Audit Committee in the Implementation of Corporate Governance (Corporate Governance)

Ghozali, Imam. 2005. Application of Multivariate Analysis with the SPSS Program. Semarang: Diponegoro University Publishing Agency.

Gujarati, Damodar N. 2004. Basic Econometrics Fourth Edition. New York: The McGraw-Hill International Edition

Herwidayatmo. 2000. Implementation of Good Corporate Governance for Indonesian Public Companies. Entrepreneur Magazine No. 10 Years XXIX October 2000

Isnanta, Rudi. 2008. The Influence of Corporate Governance and Ownership Structure on Profit Management and Financial Performance. Thesis. Indonesian Islamic University

Jensen, Michael C. and WH Meckling. 1976. Theory of The Firm: Managerial Behavior, Agency Costs and Ownership Structure. Journal of Financial Economics 3. p. 305-360.

Ministry of State Owned Enterprises. 2002. KEP-117/M-MBU/2002. Decree of the Minister of SOEs Concerning the Implementation of Good Corporate Governance Practices in State-Owned Enterprises (BUMN)

Kleins, April. 2006. Audit Committee, Board of Director Characteristics, and Earnings Management. Law & Economics Research Paper Series Working Paper No. 06- 42

Nachrowi, Nachrowi D. and Hardius Usman. 2006. Popular and practical econometric approaches to economic and financial analysis. Jakarta: Publishing Institute, Faculty of Economics, University of Indonesia

Nasution, Marihot and Doddy Setiawan. 2007. The Effect of Corporate Governance on Profit Management in the Indonesian Banking Industry. Article presented at the 10th National Accounting Symposium at Unhas Makassar on 26-28 July 2007

Rachmawati, Andri and Hanung Triatmoko. 2007. Analysis of Factors Affecting Profit Quality and Firm Value. Article presented at the 10th National Accounting Symposium at Unhas Makassar on 26-28 July 2007

Rachmawati, Yacob Suparno, and Nurul Qomariah. 2006. The Effect of Information Asymmetry on Profit Management Practices in Public Banking Companies Listed on the Jakarta Stock Exchange. Article presented at the 9th National Symposium on Accounting in Padang on 23-26 August 2006

Now, Uma. 2009. Research Methods For Business: Research Methodology For Business 4th Edition. Jakarta: Salemba Empat

Setiawati, Lilis and Ainun Na'im. 2001. Bank Health Evaluation by Bank Indonesia and Earnings Management in Banking Industry. Gadjah Mada International Journal of Business Volume 3 No 2 May: 159-176